MINUTES OF MEETING NEW JERSEY PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION January 26, 2017 10:00 a.m. 495 West State Street Trenton, New Jersey

The meeting was called to order by Chair P. Kelly Hatfield.

Present were:

Commissioners:

John Bonanni Paul Boudreau John Eskilson David Jones Paula Voos Richard Wall

Also present were:

Robin T. McMahon, General Counsel Don Horowitz, Senior Deputy General Counsel Joseph Blaney, Deputy General Counsel David Gambert, Deputy General Counsel Christine Lucarelli-Carneiro, Deputy General Counsel Kellie Hullfish, who acted as Stenographer

At the commencement of the meeting, Chair Hatfield, pursuant to Section 5 of the Open Public Meetings Act, entered this announcement into the minutes of the meeting:

Adequate notice has been provided by the dissemination of a written "Annual Notice of Meeting." On December 22, 2016 a copy of such notice was:

(a) prominently posted in a public place at the offices of the Public Employment Relations Commission;

(b) sent to the business offices of the Trenton Times and the Courier Post, as well as to the State House press row addresses of 25 media outlets;

(c) copies e-mailed to the Secretary of State for filing; and

(d) posted on the agency's web site.

Furthermore on January 20, 2017, copies of an additional written "Notice of Meeting" were posted and sent in a similar manner.

The first item for consideration was the minutes of the November 17, 2017 regular Commission meeting. A motion to adopt the minutes was made by Commissioner Bonanni and seconded by Commissioner Eskilson. Commissioners Jones, Voos and Wall were not present at that meeting and therefore declined to vote on those minutes. The motion to adopt the minutes was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Eskilson).

The next item for consideration was the minutes of the December 22, 2016 regular Commission meeting. A motion to adopt the minutes was made by Commissioner Boudreau and seconded by Commissioner Wall. Commissioner Eskilson was not present at that meeting and therefore declined to vote on those minutes. The motion to adopt the minutes was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Voos and Wall) and one opposed (Commissioner Jones).

The Counsel's Office distributed a monthly report.

Chair Hatfield announced that plans are being made for the Public Employment Relations Commission Symposium which is scheduled for October 13, 2017.

The next item for consideration is the <u>Franklin Board of</u> <u>Education and Quakertown Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2017-011. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the

-2-

draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>West Orange Board of Education and West Orange Education</u> <u>Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-073. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting on this matter because the law firm of Cleary, Giacobbe, Alfieri and Jacobs is labor counsel to Morris County. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson and Wall) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Township of Nutley and PBA Local 33 (Superiors) and PBA Local 33</u>, Docket Nos. CO-2015-186 and CO-2015-187. Commissioner Bonanni moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. Commissioner Wall was recused from voting on this matter because of his affiliation with the PBA. Commissioner Jones abstained from consideration. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson and Voos).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Delaware Valley Regional Board of Education and Delaware Valley</u> <u>Regional Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-077.

-3-

Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Eskilson) and three opposed (Commissioners Jones, Voos and Wall). Commissioners Jones and Voos voted against the draft decision because they favored allowing an arbitrator to assess whether there was just cause to issue both the November 23, 2015 memorandum and the January 19, 2016 memorandum.

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Township of Lyndhurst and Lyndhurst Policemen's Benevolent</u> <u>Association, Local 202</u>, Docket No. SN-2017-016. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Bonanni seconded the motion. Commissioner Wall was recused from voting on this matter because of his affiliation with the PBA. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau and Eskilson) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Trenton Board of Education and Trenton Education Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2017-014. Commissioner Boudreau moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau,

-4-

Eskilson and Voos) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Wall).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Bergenfield Board of Education and Bergenfield Education</u> <u>Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2017-015. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson and Voos) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Wall).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Passaic City Board of Education and Passaic Education</u> <u>Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2017-001. Commissioner Eskilson moved the draft decision and Commissioner Boudreau seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting on this matter because the law firm of Cleary, Giacobbe, Alfieri and Jacobs is labor counsel to Morris County. The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of four in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Boudreau, Eskilson and Wall) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The next item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>Ocean Township Board of Education and Waretown Education</u> <u>Association</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-035. Commissioner Bonanni moved the draft decision and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion.

-5-

The motion to adopt the draft decision was approved by a vote of five in favor (Chair Hatfield, Commissioners Bonanni, Boudreau, Eskilson and Wall) and two opposed (Commissioners Jones and Voos).

The final item for consideration was the draft decision in <u>City of Perth Amboy and International Association of Firefighters</u> <u>Local 286</u>, Docket No. SN-2016-064. Commissioner Jones moved the draft decision and Commissioner Wall seconded the motion. Commissioner Bonanni was recused from voting on this matter because the law firm of DeCotiis, Fitzpatrick and Cole represents Morris County. The motion to adopt the draft decision was unanimously approved (Chair Hatfield, Boudreau, Eskilson, Jones, Voos and Wall).

Commissioner Jones moved to adjourn the meeting and Commissioner Eskilson seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved. The meeting was adjourned.

The next regular meeting is scheduled to be held on Thursday, February 23, 2017.

-6-